

COPYING A CD BEFORE REPLACING IT

by Rabbi Yisroel Belsky ztl

QUESTION 83: COPYING A CD BEFORE REPLACING IT

I borrowed a CD from a friend and lost it. I'm now going to buy the same title, in order to 'give back' the CD to him, to replace the one I lost. Before I give him the replacement CD, can I make a copy for myself?

RABBI BELSKY

If you borrowed something and then lost it, you are required to pay the person to replace the item. That means that the new CD - the one you bought as a replacement - was really your friend's from the very beginning. Therefore, if you buy the replacement - and copy it before giving it to him - then this situation is exactly the same as if you borrowed your friend's CD and copied it, which cannot be done. In effect, instead of buying your own CD, you're copying your friend's, and you're cutting into the business of the producer. You lost the CD that you borrowed, and now you are buying a CD to pay him back. So now the CD you're considering copying in effect belongs to him.

NEXT WEEK'S QUESTION 84: MAKING COPY OF CD FOR SPOUSE

I bought a CD that I listen to in my car. Can I make a copy so my wife can listen to it in her car also?

Participate in the [Honesty Forum](#), and discuss the issues we confront in this class!

Subscribe to *Honesty* and receive this class via e-mail.

[Honesty Archives](#)

Honesty, Copyright © 2004 by Rabbi Yisroel Belsky Shli"ta and [Torah.org](#).